

Nos. 23-2882, 23-2886, 23-3146

---

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

---

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY, et al.,  
*Plaintiffs-Appellees/ Plaintiffs-Appellants,*

and

ALLIANCE FOR THE WILD ROCKIES, et al.,  
*Plaintiffs-Appellees/ Plaintiffs,*

v.

UNITED STATES FOREST SERVICE, et al.,  
*Defendants-Appellants/ Defendants/ Defendants-Appellees,*

and

KOOTENAI TRIBE OF IDAHO,  
*Intervenor-Defendant/ Intervenor-Defendant-Appellant/  
Intervenor Defendant-Appellee.*

---

Appeal from the United States District Court for the District of Montana  
No. 9:22-cv-114 (Hon. Donald W. Molloy)

---

**JOINT EXCERPTS OF RECORD – INDEX VOLUME**

---

Of Counsel:

ELISE FOSTER

*Attorney*

U.S. Dep't of Agriculture

KATHRYN L. WILLIAMS-SHUCK

SARAH E. MCLAIN

*Attorneys*

U.S. Dep't of the Interior

TODD KIM

*Assistant Attorney General*

THEKLA HANSEN-YOUNG

HAYLEY A. CARPENTER

ERIKA A. FURLONG

JOHN P. TUSTIN

JACOB D. ECKER

*Attorneys*

Environment and Natural Resources Division

U.S. Department of Justice

Post Office Box 7415

Washington, D.C. 20044

(202) 305-0466

jacob.ecker@usdoj.gov

Julie A. Weis  
HAGLUND KELLEY LLP

Kris A. McLean  
Tyson A. McLean  
Kris A. McLean Law Firm

*Attorneys for Defendant-Intervenor-Appellant Kootenai  
Tribe of Idaho*

Index for Joint Excerpts of Record  
*Center for Biological Diversity, et al. v. United States Forest Service, et al.*  
 Nos. 23-2882, 23-2886, 23-3146

<b>1-ER-1-66</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Judgment, August 17, 2023	94	2
Opinion and Order, August 17, 2023	93	4

<b>2-ER-67-361</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Letter from Montana Department of Natural Resources and Conservation in Support of Black Ram Project, March 21, 2023	69	69
Kootenai Tribe of Idaho Statement of Disputed Facts (Excerpt), March 20, 2023	68	71
Federal Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Cross-Motion for Summary J. and Resp. in Opp. to Pls.' and Consol. Pls.' Mots. For Summary J., March 9, 2023	61	80
Declaration of Wayne Kasworm, March 9, 2023	61-1	162
Brief in Support of Alliance for the Wild Rockies' Mot. for Summary J., January 27, 2023	53	170
AWR Complaint for Injunctive and Declaratory Relief (Excerpt), January 6, 2023	1 (Consol. Case No. 23-3)	215
United States Fish and Wildlife Service Administrative Record Index, December 13, 2022	35-2	226
Revised Biological Opinion on the Effects of the Black Ram Project on Grizzly Bears ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 1-77</i> ), August 26, 2022	35	240
Selkirk/Cabinet-Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Zones 2020 Bear Year Annual Monitoring Report ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 985-1065</i> ), 2021	35	317

<b>3-ER-362–659</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Selkirk/Cabinet-Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Zones 2020 Bear Year Annual Monitoring Report ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 985-1065</i> ), 2021 (continued)	35	364
Species status assessment for the grizzly bear ( <i>Ursus arctos horribilis</i> ) in the lower-48 states: a biological report ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 1066-1433</i> ), 2021	35	400

<b>4-ER-660–877</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Species status assessment for the grizzly bear ( <i>Ursus arctos horribilis</i> ) in the lower-48 states: a biological report ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 1066-1433</i> ), 2021 (continued)	35	662
Cabinet-Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Area 2020 Research and Monitoring Progress Report ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 1445-1552</i> ), 2021	35	731
Selkirk/Cabinet-Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Zones 2019 Bear Year Annual Monitoring Report ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 1741-1779</i> ), 2020	35	839

<b>5-ER-878–1132</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Biological Opinion on the Effects of the Kootenai National Forest Land Management Plan on the Grizzly Bear ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 1912-2060</i> ), 2020	35	880
Record of Decision for Access Amendments (Excerpt) ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 4498-4571</i> ), 2011	35	1029
Access Amendments Biological Opinion (Excerpt) ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 4572-4798</i> ), 2011	35	1033
Revised Interagency Grizzly Bear Taskforce Report: Grizzly Bear/Motorized Access Management ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 5019-5026</i> ), 1998	35	1035
Grizzly Bear Recovery Plan (Excerpt) ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 5285-5479</i> ), 1993	35	1043
Selkirk / Cabinet-Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Zones 2020 Bear Year Annual Monitoring Summary Report ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 6160-6240</i> ), July 20, 2021	35	1046

<b>5-ER-878–1132</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Email chain re: further supplemental information ( <i>FWS Admin. Rec. 6578-6583</i> ), June 23, 2021	35	1127

<b>6-ER-1133–1418</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
United States Forest Service Administrative Record Index, December 6, 2022	34-2	1135
Land Management Plan, 2015 Revision, Kootenai National Forest ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 1-189</i> ), 2015	34	1315

<b>7-ER-1419–1715</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Land Management Plan, 2015 Revision, Kootenai National Forest ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 1-189</i> ), 2015 (continued)	34	1421
Final EIS for Revised Land Management Plan (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 190-875</i> ), August 2013	34	1506
2020 Forest Plan Biological Assessment for Grizzly Bear ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 933-1055</i> )	34	1508
Decision Notice and Finding of No Significant Impact for Black Ram Project ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 2146-2230</i> )	34	1631

<b>8-ER-1716–2013</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Black Ram Final Environmental Assessment (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 2231-2828</i> ), June 21, 2022	34	1718
Black Ram draft environmental assessment (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 3499-4031</i> ), July 2019	34	1796
Black Ram Project Biological Assessment (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 4198-4349</i> ), September 16, 2020	34	1798

<b>8-ER-1716-2013</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Updated road closure information in the Project area ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 4524</i> ), June 17, 2022	34	1804
Process review for assessing BMU metrics for the project-specific grizzly bear analysis in the Black Ram Project ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 4529-33</i> ), June 2, 2022	34	1805
Forest Service Response to the Yaak Valley Forest Council's Forest Road Barriers and Gates Claim ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 4558-4605</i> ), October 30, 2021	34	1810
A review of Wakkinen and Kasworm (1997) Report as Best Available Science for the Selkirk and Cabinet-Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Zones ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 4646-4677</i> ), October 2011	34	1858
Interagency Grizzly Bear Taskforce Report (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 5138-5147</i> ), 1994	34	1890
Interim Access Management Rule Set (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 5148-5157</i> ), 1998	34	1892
Cabinet Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Area 2017 (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 5336-5437</i> ), 2018	34	1894
Cabinet Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Area 2018 Research and Monitoring Report (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 5483-5580</i> ), 2019	34	1897
Cabinet Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Area 2021 Research and Monitoring Report ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 5689-5802</i> ), 2022	34	1900

<b>9-ER-2014-2261</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Cabinet Yaak Grizzly Bear Recovery Area 2019 Research and Monitoring Report (Excerpt) ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 5933-6037</i> ), 2020	34	2016
Kootenai Tribe of Idaho Letter to Council on Environmental Quality ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 32834-35</i> ), October 8, 2021	34	2019

<b>9-ER-2014–2261</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Alliance for the Wild Rockies and Native Ecosystems Council Comments to Black Ram Project EA ( <i>Forest Service Admin. R. 34673-34828</i> ), August 7, 2019	34	2021
Holloway roads November 2021 - Post objection information submitted by Wild Earth guardians ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 44261-44266</i> ), April 25, 2022	34	2177
Forest Service Response to Allegedly Ineffective Road Closures ( <i>Forest Service Admin. Rec. 44664-44688</i> ), December 21, 2021	34	2183
CBD First Amended Complaint, December 2, 2022	31	2208
Declaration of Scott Soult, October 21, 2022	23-7	2231
Declaration of Gary Aitken, Jr., October 21, 2022	23-6	2248

<b>10-ER-2262–2318</b>		
<b>Document Name</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>ER</b>
Federal Defendants' notice of appeal, October 11, 2023	102	2264
Tribe's notice of appeal, October 13, 2023	103	2267
CBD's notice of cross-appeal, October 25, 2023	105	2279
Docket Sheet for Lead Case (9:22-cv-114)		2288
Docket Sheet for Consolidated Case (9:22-cv-3)		2307